
George W. Pugh

Repository Citation
Available at: https://digitalcommons.law.lsu.edu/lalrev/vol24/iss1/14

This Book Review is brought to you for free and open access by the Law Reviews and Journals at LSU Law Digital Commons. It has been accepted for inclusion in Louisiana Law Review by an authorized editor of LSU Law Digital Commons. For more information, please contact kreed25@lsu.edu.
review articles of Louisiana’s own Professor Malone to remind
us of the immense contribution he has already made to develop-
ment of tort and workmen’s compensation law. By this work,
he and his co-editor, Professor Plant of Michigan, have, in the
opinion of the reviewer, made yet another valuable contribu-
tion to the study and application of compensation law, by fur-
nishing not only an excellent teaching device, but also a stimu-
lating and most useful aid to thinking and research concerning
practical compensation problems. The usefulness of this work
should extend beyond the law schools and into the working li-
braries of practicing judges and attorneys, who I am sure will
find this work as valuable and as interesting as did the present
reviewer.

Albert Tate, Jr.*

Police Power and Individual Freedom — The Quest for Balance,
edited by Claude R. Sowle. Aldine Publishing Company,

Freedom under law is not unfettered freedom: through law,
society often, in order to promote freedom, curtails it. A law
prohibiting murder limits the freedom of the would-be murder-
er, but certainly promotes that of prospective murderees. Our
criminal law in a sense reflects the balance struck by society be-
tween our interests in freedom from restraint and our interest
in protection for freedom.

The point is important also when we come to the question
of the administration of criminal justice. For such a system to
be effective, some sacrifice in personal freedom must be borne
by someone — sacrifice that must be suffered if society is to
be protected for freedom. Clearly, a system must make provi-
sion for arrests, for searches and seizures, and even for com-
pelled testimony, but under what circumstances, what condi-
tions, and with what safeguards?

Stated succinctly, the question is this: “What price in free-
dom is to be paid for freedom?” Although the balance struck
from country to country will differ, the problems faced are sim-
lar. As witnessed by recent decisions of the United States Su-
preme Court, we in this country are now in the throes of “agon-

*Judge, Court of Appeal, Third Circuit, State of Louisiana.
izing reappraisal" of our own system. A consideration of the experience and thinking of other countries in this connection is therefore particularly appropriate.

Police Power and Individual Freedom — The Quest for Balance, it seems to this reviewer, was designed to afford just such consideration. Taken as a whole, from concept to completion, it does an excellent job. Edited by Professor Claude R. Sowle of Northwestern University, this book brings together in a single volume papers delivered at the International Conference on Criminal Law Administration,¹ held at Northwestern University in connection with its School of Law's centennial celebration. Outstanding legal scholars from all over the world were assembled, with the aid of a grant from the Ford Foundation, and were asked to direct their attention specifically to four of the most challenging problems of evidence and criminal procedure: (1) Police Detention and Arrest Privileges, (2) The Exclusionary Rule Regarding Illegally Seized Evidence, (3) Police Interrogation Privileges and Limitations, and (4) The Privilege Against Self-Incrimination. These four topics constitute the four Parts of this book, and each Part follows a like format. Following splendid comprehensive articles in each area by American scholars, foreign authorities comment on the law in that area in their respective countries (Canada, England, France, Germany, Israel, Japan, and Norway).

In the preparation of the papers under each of these Parts, the writers were asked to consider certain specific questions. Illustrative of the kind of questions considered, those asked in connection with arrest and detention may be cited:

"(1) In the absence of sufficient grounds for an arrest, should the police have a right to stop and question a person as to his identity and reason for being where he is, if the appearance or conduct of that person has reasonably aroused police suspicion?

"(2) Should the police be permitted to search such a person for weapons or for incriminating evidence?

"(3) If police practices of this nature are to be legally sanctioned, what limitations should be imposed?

"(4) With respect to police arrest statutes generally, should more freedom be granted to the police in recognition of their contentions that existing laws are obsolete and hamper police attempts to meet the public demand for adequate police protection?"

The impact of the book in its entirety is highly effective. Although at times individual papers, particularly in the foreign law section, seem to be unduly concerned with the minutiae of rule, and lose contact somewhat with broader policy considerations, generally the book successfully pursues its objective—"the quest for balance." The inclusion of foreign law commentaries is certainly appropriate, for, as suggested by Justice Black in his concurring opinion in *Rochin v. California*, the search for the balance "implicit in the concept of ordered liberty" is not the exclusive concern of the people of the English-speaking world. This fine book is an articulate witness to the magnificent contribution which Northwestern University's School of Law has long made in the areas of evidence and criminal procedure, and thus a most appropriate outgrowth of its centennial celebration.

George W. Pugh*

*A Short Commentary on the Law of Scotland*, by T. B. Smith, Q.C., D.C.L., LL.D., F.B.A., Professor of Civil Law in the University of Edinburgh. (Edinburgh: W. Green & Son, Ltd. 1962. xx and 865 and (appendices, tables and index) 112 pp.)

Also published as:


---

*Professor of Law, Louisiana State University.*